

Reply to the Gary King Archive of the Controversy that surrounded the publication of “The Limits of Ecological Inference: The Case of Split Ticket Voting” (*American Journal of Political Science* 48, 1 (January 2004): 152-171.

Two decades ago, we published a paper in *AJPS* that critiqued a 1998 *APSR* paper by Burden and Kimball in which they used King’s EI method to study split-ticket voting. Our paper had previously been forthcoming at the *APSR*. Without getting into copious details about how and why that paper was subject to an extraordinarily unorthodox review process, culminating in a very rare withdrawal of acceptance by the departing editor, we feel the need now to set at least one piece of the record straight.

Our paper was subject to an unusually stringent peer-review process at the *APSR* involving 3 fresh rounds of reviewers (with 10 different reviewers in total) over a period of 3 years. After satisfying all of the reviewers, our article was accepted for publication. Burden, Kimball, and King had been given the opportunity to reply to our article in a peer-reviewed context, but they did not do so then, and have never done so. Instead, they produced a self-posted web archive. We think it is fair to say that if you are a University Professor at Harvard, you are aware that intellectual exchanges occur in peer-reviewed contexts, not via self-curated collections that are posted online in a non-peer-reviewed “archive”. It is clear that this archive is intended to be damaging to our character, not to further an intellectual exchange about methodology or politics. It certainly makes incorrect technical claims and advances unfounded, unprofessional, and personal attacks about character.

We stand by our claims, as do 10 reviewers from the *APSR* and 3 additional reviewers from *AJPS*.

It is an understatement to say that we have been generous in our silence on the matter over all of these years. Indeed, we felt that this was well behind us now. Ten years ago, we thought we had an agreement with Gary King about the lack of value of his self-posted archive. He agreed to remove it from the ICPSR archive. (See email exchange below). However, the “archive” has now re-appeared on Gary King’s webpage as one of his “publications” in 2002. It is not a publication in any academic sense, and it is not correct. That this appears anywhere on the internet, especially on his personal webpage as a publication, strikes us as needlessly provocative, particularly given our email exchange from 2014.

We would welcome an intellectual exchange. Distorted disparagement masquerading as a publication is most unwelcome.

On Apr 22, 2014, at 2:08 PM, Gary King <king@harvard.edu> wrote:

Hi Wendy, the ICPSR says they will take down the archive now.

Gary

--

Gary King - Albert J. Weatherhead III University Professor - Director, IQSS - Harvard University
GaryKing.org - King@Harvard.edu - [@KingGary](https://www.instagram.com/KingGary) - 617-500-7570 - fax 812-8581 - Assistant: 495-9271

From: Gary King <king@harvard.edu>

Subject: Re: ICPSR archive

Date: April 13, 2014 at 6:38:08 PM CDT

To: "Cho, Wendy K Tam" <wendych@illinois.edu>

ok, getting there. requests have gone in. more soon...

Gary

--

Gary King - Albert J. Weatherhead III University Professor - Director, [IQSS](#) - Harvard University
[GaryKing.org](#) - [King@Harvard.edu](#) - [@KingGary](#) - 617-500-7570 - fax 812-8581 - [Assistant](#): 495-9271

On Thu, Feb 13, 2014 at 6:39 AM, Gary King <king@harvard.edu> wrote:
just be a little patient. believe me, this has not been forgotten. and I will be back in touch no matter what.

Gary

--

Gary King - Albert J. Weatherhead III University Professor - Director, [IQSS](#) - Harvard University
[GaryKing.org](#) - [King@Harvard.edu](#) - [@KingGary](#) - 617-500-7570 - fax 812-8581 - [Assistant](#): 495-9271

On Wed, Feb 12, 2014 at 7:45 AM, Cho, Wendy K Tam <wendych@illinois.edu> wrote:

Hi Gary,

Is there something I can do to help you here?

W

On Jan 24, 2014, at 2:39 PM, Gary King <king@harvard.edu> wrote:

Hi Wendy, I haven't forgotten; let me keep working on this...

Gary

--

Gary King - Albert J. Weatherhead III University Professor - Director, [IQSS](#) - Harvard University
[GaryKing.org](#) - [King@Harvard.edu](#) - [@KingGary](#) - 617-500-7570 - fax 812-8581 - [Assistant](#): 495-9271

On Fri, Jan 24, 2014 at 10:08 AM, Cho, Wendy K Tam <wendych@illinois.edu> wrote:

Hi Gary,

Thanks. I appreciate it. Any update from David and Barry on this?

W

On Jan 16, 2014, at 10:23 AM, Gary King <king@harvard.edu> wrote:

Hi Wendy, I appreciate the note. let me talk with David and Barry & get back to you.

Gary

--

Gary King - Albert J. Weatherhead III University Professor - Director, [IQSS](#) - Harvard University
[GaryKing.org](#) - [King@Harvard.edu](#) - [@KingGary](#) - 617-500-7570 - fax 812-8581 - [Assistant](#): 495-9271

On Thu, Jan 16, 2014 at 9:40 AM, Cho, Wendy K Tam <wendych@illinois.edu> wrote:

Hi Gary,

I was wondering if you would consider removing this ICPSR archive.

<http://www.icpsr.umich.edu/icpsrweb/ICPSR/studies/1264>

I've known of it for some time, but it recently came to my attention again. I know we have had quite a heated exchange over EI in the past. That much certainly cannot be denied. However, I have always kept my writing in peer-reviewed journals. You (Barry and David) have had an opportunity to respond through the journal process but have chosen not to do so. What you have put in this archive is not peer-reviewed nor technically correct. It is intended to be damaging to my character, not to further an intellectual exchange. I would be happy to have an intellectual exchange, but this archive is not in that spirit. I think we have moved beyond these types of ad hominem attacks, so I respectfully request that you remove it. I have never behaved in this manner toward you despite having my own set of recorded exchanges with you over the years. I don't think that would be fair to you, so I am simply requesting the same level of respect be returned to me.

I think it has taken some time for us to move beyond this exchange that started in 1997... given that it's now 2014, I'm hopeful we can put this fully behind us and move forward with mutual respect. Please let me know how you feel about this.

Thanks.

W